Scramble for the Past. A *Story of Archaeology in the Ottoman Empire, 1753-1914.* Zainab Bahrani, Zeynep Çelik, and Edhem Eldem, eds. İstanbul: SALT, 2011. h/bk 519 pp. ISBN 978-9944-731-27-0. Price $74.00; *Osman Hamdi Bey & the Americans: Archaeology, Diplomacy, Art.* Renata Holod and Robert Ousterhout, eds. İstanbul: Pera Museum, 2011. p/bk 411 pp. ISBN 978-975-9123-89-5. Price TL 90; *John Henry Haynes.* A *Photographer and Archaeologist in the Ottoman Empire 1881-1900.* Robert G. Ousterhout. İstanbul: Cornucopia Books, 2011. p/bk 148 pp. ISBN 978-605-62429-0-8; 978-0-9565948-1-5. Price £15.39.

By coincidence, three excellent, handsome books on archaeological activity in the later Ottoman Empire were published in İstanbul in 2011. They complement each other well. The first, *Scramble for the Past,* published in separate English and Turkish editions, accompanied an exhibition held 22 November 2011 - 11 March 2012 at SALT Galata, the cultural center established by Garanti Bank in 2010. Ottoman actions and opinions are tracked, as are selected cases of foreign activity within the Ottoman Empire (British, French, German, and Austrian). The resulting anthology, varied and informative though it is, lacks consideration of Egypt (a world unto itself), Cyprus, and Palestine (where interest in the Bible sparked exploration). Also missing is mention of American investigations. For the American role one must turn to the second book, *Osman Hamdi Bey & the Americans*, the bilingual (English and Turkish) catalogue of an exhibition at the Pera Museum, İstanbul, that opened on 11 October 2011. This book, loosely focused on the lives of three contrasting figures, the Ottoman archaeologist and artist Osman Hamdi Bey (1842-1910), the American archaeologist and photographer John Henry Haynes (1849-1910), and the German Assyriologist, Hermann Vollrath Hilprecht (1859-1925), gives a full look at the two American excavations carried out in the Ottoman Empire in the last two decades of the nineteenth century -- the first at Assos, a classical city on the northeast Aegean coast; the second at Nippur, an important Sumerian city in southern Iraq. Not included are American excavations from the early twentieth century, notably Sardis.

The exhibition was initiated by a consideration of two paintings by Osman Hamdi Bey in the University of Pennsylvania Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology. The later of the two, “The Excavation of the

Temple Court at Nippur" (1903), has an archaeological subject, a central excavation area as revealed during the explorations at Nippur sponsored by the University of Pennsylvania in 1888-1900. Osman Hamdi Bey based his painting not on personal observation but on a photograph taken by the expedition photographer and field director, John Henry Haynes. The earlier painting, "At the Mosque Door" (1891), shows a picturesque, Orientalist assortment of people outside the entrance of a mosque. Although a vintage Osman Hamdi Bey work, it somehow disappeared from notice at the museum, only to be rediscovered in 2007. Its importance for the overall aim of the exhibit and book is minor, even if piquant: the University bought the painting for an inflated price, part of a campaign to persuade the powerful Osman Hamdi Bey to grant the University permits to excavate at Nippur and to export some of the finds to Philadelphia.

The third book focuses on Haynes. To a certain extent it overlaps with the second book, for Haynes participated in the American excavations at Assos in 1881-1883 before he joined the Nippur project. But this book offers a deeper look at Haynes, his life and work. And poignant and impressive this is. Haynes was largely forgotten, his achievements minimized by the directors of the two projects, his own life ending in a decade-long downward spiral of mental illness that began soon after the end of the work at Nippur. By then, attention and emotions had focused on the bitter controversy between John Punnett Peters and Hilprecht, the scientific directors of the excavation. Haynes, psychologically incapable of giving testimony, and in any case not an academic with a scholarly interest in the Ancient Near East, became irrelevant. He was, however, an accomplished photographer, a pioneer in the photography of ancient and medieval sites, notably in central Anatolia where he travelled in the mid-1880s. Robert Ousterhout, a professor of Byzantine art and architecture at the University of Pennsylvania, has scoured the archives to provide a fascinating collection of Haynes' photographs and accompanied them with a full appreciation of their value and interest today. He has brought Haynes back to life.

The broad aim of *Scramble for the Past* is "to explore the archaeological enterprise in Ottoman lands from the mid-eighteenth century to the early twentieth in all its myriad forms, foreign and local" (13-16). Given that this is a collection of essays by fifteen collaborators, not the work of a single author, the scope and the outlook of the articles vary considerably.

Nonetheless, the book achieves its goal as a stimulating overview, with detailed studies of specific explorers and significant situations. Copiously furnished with bibliographic citations, *Scramble for the Past* will serve as an important resource for future research.

Of particular note are the chapters that deal with the Ottoman role in archaeological activity within their empire. Osman Hamdi Bey has always been well known, but the changing contexts and outlooks during this period of more than 150 years are not so familiar. Edhem Eldem's essay is fundamental. He traces the evolution of Ottoman reactions to western European interventions from the period of Lord Elgin to the first antiquities law in 1869. At first, indifference; then growing awareness of the political significance of antiquities; finally indignation at the pillaging of ancient sites: such were the stages the Ottomans went through. The antiquities law would be substantially revised in 1874 and again in 1884. By this time, a major archaeological museum was established in Istanbul (Shaw). Osman Hamdi Bey, its director from 1881 until his death in 1910, had carried out his own explorations at Nemrud Dağı (1883) and would later supervise the removal of spectacular sarcophagi from a necropolis at Sidon (1887) and collaborate with French archaeologists in the excavation of the Sanctuary of Hekate at Lagina (1891-1892). By the end of the century, the Ottomans had caught up with the Europeans.

In a complementary essay, Zeynep Çelik explores the different ways in which knowledge of antiquities was publicized among the Ottomans in the final half century of the empire. Sultan Abdülhamid II, who reigned from 1876-1909, commissioned enormous quantities of photographs of the empire; archaeological work and antiquities were among the subjects. Provincial yearbooks *(salnames)* included comments on antiquities, as did official reports, documents now preserved in the Prime Minister's Ottoman Archives in İstanbul. The reading public learned from book-length overviews of world history and illustrated magazines. But following the Western interest in classical and pre-classical antiquities would not be the only path. Thanks to popular articles on the extensive restoration of the Great Umayyad Mosque in Damascus following a fire in 1893, Ottoman readers were made aware of the importance of Arab Islamic culture to the Ottoman identity. Indeed 1914, announced in the book's title as the end of the period under examination, refers not to the outbreak of World War

I but to the opening in İstanbul of the Museum of Pious Foundations, the first Ottoman museum devoted to Islamic art (418-421).

Throughout the book, the role of antiquities in the formation of national identities is an important theme. The Ottomans were by no means the only society affected. The Parthenon sculptures removed by Elgin (Tolias), the elevation to iconic status of the Venus de Milo (Jockey), and travel accounts (Basch) counted much for the British and the French. Even in as small a region as Lebanon, Renan's research on the Phoenicians (Laurens) and the varied reactions of visitors to the great temple complex at Baalbek (Makdisi) would reverberate for years to come.

Cultural politics also came into play. Possessing the past would be a mark of prestige, so competition for spectacular finds was great. In addition to the classical world, Mesopotamia was a key battle ground between British and French (Bahrani). Explorations could have numerous motives, though. In his essay on Layard, the great pioneer in Assyrian archaeology, Malley stresses the politically oriented activities of Layard's multifaceted life - secret agent and diplomat as well as explorer - thereby placing Layard in the context of nineteenth-century British imperialism. The picture is rather unsavory. Oddly, the Austrians, powerful neighbors of the Ottomans, were latecomers in this competition, because their Habsburg rulers were not interested in antiquities. In the later nineteenth century, however, they made a push in southwestern Anatolia, eventually gaining a permit to excavate at Ephesus (Szemethy). Interest in medieval cultures advanced also. Robert Ousterhout traces the increased understanding of Byzantine Constantinople, mostly through textual and topographic research. Two essays discuss the exploration of Islamic sites by German scholars, the Abbasid capital at Samarra by Herzfeld (Phillip), Seljuk sites in Anatolia by Sarre (Pancaroğlu).

The most unexpected view comes early in the book. Yannis Hamilakis points out that interest in antiquities is not the exclusive province of the educated. In early nineteenth century Eleusis, site of a celebrated mysteries cult in Greek and Roman times, villagers believed the ancient statue of a woman whose hair was decorated with ears of wheat ensured agricultural fertility. Edward Clarke, a scholar of plants and antiquarian, disregarded this veneration and had the statue shipped to England. We might dismiss the villagers' interest as ignorance, but Hamilakis notes

that such a modernist view Orientalizes others and, from a position of superiority, unjustly rejects the validity of their reactions. In contrast, we should respect such “indigenous” or “vernacular” archaeology (61-4). One can imagine that neither Osman Hamdi Bey nor his French, German, or American colleagues would have sympathized with this view.

Americans entered this world in the 1880s, latecomers like the Austrians. The reasons were different, however. After the Civil War, industry expanded apace, with the creation of great wealth for some. Interest in archaeology of the eastern Mediterranean and Near East developed as in Western Europe, a part of the intellectual climate. Institutions to foster this were founded, notably the Archaeological Institute of America (1879). The guiding light and first president of the AIA was Charles Eliot Norton, professor of classics at Harvard. Under his impetus, the AIA sought places to excavate, in order to gain finds for American museums as well as for research (Allen). A classical site was desired; Assos, a modest-sized city with a modest place in recorded history, was the choice. Excavations took place for three years, 1881-1883, led by Joseph Thacher Clarke and Francis Bacon. John Henry Haynes signed on as the expedition photographer (Wescoat). Haynes had learned the techniques of architectural photography in a brief apprenticeship with William James Stillman, an American photographer of the Athenian Acropolis, shortly before he went to Assos. He clearly took to the medium right away.

The site proved rewarding. The dramatic topography features an unusual, early Doric temple (dedicated to Athena) on the hilltop, well preserved fortification walls (fourth century BC) enclosing the lower city center, and a good range of civic buildings. Clarke and Bacon were architects, which served the site well. Not far in the distance was Osman Hamdi Bey. Issuing from a prominent family - his father, Edhem Pasha, served as Grand Vizier - he was an experienced bureaucrat, a canny archaeologist, and an accomplished painter (Holod & Ousterhout, Sanecki, Hughes & Neumeier, Fetvaci). As the director of the Archaeological Museum in istanbul, he had control over archaeological activities within the empire. The 1884 antiquities law, for which he was responsible, declared all archaeological finds to be the property of the state; in addition, finds were to remain in the empire. In practice, exceptions might be made, “gifts” that could fulfill diplomatic needs. The Assos excavations had just ended when the new law came into effect. Norton and the AIA had hoped that

many of the finds would be sent to America. But Clarke, disappointingly irresponsible as the project director, somehow ran afoul of Osman Hamdi Bey, with the result that far fewer finds made their way to Boston. The book includes two fascinating letters written by Haynes to Norton in September and October 1885, in which Haynes describes this conflict, gives insight into the character of Osman Hamdi Bey, and proposes how to resolve the dilemma.

After the Assos project ended, Haynes, who had been teaching at Robert College, İstanbul, left that post for another at Central Turkey College, an American mission school in Aintab (Gaziantep). During the 1880s, he traveled in central Anatolia, taking photographs of ancient and medieval monuments, often the first-ever pictures taken of them.

In the mid-1880s, Haynes' career took another turn, one that would bring dramatic consequences. In addition to classical civilizations, Americans were interested in the world of the Bible and its roots in the civilizations of the Ancient Near East. In 1884-1885, an expedition funded by Catherine Wolfe traveled in Mesopotamia with the aim of identifying a site for an American team to excavate. Haynes joined that group. Among the sites visited was Nuffar, ancient Nippur, in the marshlands of southern Iraq. The newly created Babylonian Exploration Fund of the University of Pennsylvania decided to sponsor excavations here, in four seasons of varying length, 1888-89, 1889-90, 1893-96, and 1898-1900 (Zettler). J. P. Peters, an Episcopal priest and a scholar of Semitic languages, and H. V. Hilprecht, by then a professor of Assyriology at the University of Pennsylvania, were the scientific directors. Haynes was the field manager.

Conditions were very difficult in this remote area occupied by warring feudal tribes, barely under Ottoman control. At the end of the first season, locals robbed them and burned their camp. Hilprecht refused to return (until the very end of the final season in 1900). Peters came for a second season, but no more. Nonetheless, the promise of the site was such that work continued, and, as documents in this exhibition show, Osman Hamdi Bey (the gatekeeper for permits to work and to export finds) was duly honored by the University of Pennsylvania with honorary membership in its Archaeological Society and with the purchase of his painting, "At the Mosque Door." Hilprecht, meanwhile, a vainglorious but

certainly charismatic man, persuaded the university to grant him frequent leaves of absence in İstanbul and Germany.

Haynes soldiered on to the end. In the final season, he made a great discovery: a large cache of tablets in the Sumerian language, which together with the smaller quantities found in the previous seasons are "to this day [...] foundational for the study of Mesopotamian civilization" (Holod and Ousterhout 368). Hilprecht arrived for the final months, in time to stake his claim as the discoverer of much at Nippur. The exhibition contains a long letter, written in April 1900, from Hilprecht to Halil Edhem Bey, Osman Hamdi Bey's younger brother and assistant director at the museum, in German, in which he describes the good results, and denigrates Haynes. He couldn't see the tablets, for they had already been packed for shipment by the time he arrived. This fact would serve him badly when he later claimed to have excavated them himself. Hilprecht would be formally accused by Peters of exaggerating his role in the discoveries, misrepresenting the contents of the tablets (having not bothered to unpack them), and keeping some finds for himself. The ensuing scandal led to Hilprecht's resignation from the University of Pennsylvania and his return to Germany.

The last of the three books deepens our knowledge of Haynes' life and work. With the outline of his career and a certain number of his photographs presented in *Osman Hamdi Bey and the Americans,* there is some overlap between the two books. But Ousterhout's book gives more information about Haynes, reproduces more photographs, and offers an excellent evaluation of the scientific and artistic value of his pictures. It's a great shame that Haynes, clearly a modest person, was overshadowed by the powerful personalities of Peters, Hilprecht, and others; and very sad that the last ten years of his life, from the end of the Nippur excavations until his death in 1910, were spent in mental difficulty. When one sees the picture of the first expedition camp at Nippur (fig. 92), a grim series of tents and mud huts laid out like a Roman military camp on the vast, flat, featureless plain of southern Iraq, one can understand that the seeds of future madness were already planted.

Charles Gates
Bilkent University, Ankara